IJST privileged information
INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SPEECH TECHNOLOGY

III. DETAILED COMMENTS

Please type or print below why you rated the paper as you
did in sections I and II. It is important that you indicate
WHAT REVISIONS, if any, the author(s) should make. List
optional and mandatory changes seperately. Feel free to
attach extra sheets as needed.

This paper would make an excellent book chapter. It reviews traditional computer
assisted instruction architectures (including adaptive sequencing), the new SCORM
standards for learning objects, an example reading tutor with speech recognition
(Mostow's Reading Tutor), dialogue systems, speech recognition, and the Communicator
architecture. It presents its own tutor with speech recognition as an example. It is also
pretty well written.

Although this would make a good book chapter, there are four concerns that prevent me
from recommending this as a journal article, unless the editor desires a journal article that
is pitched at a general tutorial level.

1. One problem is that there is no evaluation of their system. Because of this, we have
here merely a description of their system, with a suitable background literature. More is
expected in a journal article unless there is a special assignment.

2. There were deficits in some of the literature, although I was overall impressed with the
scholarship. There are more recent tutoring systems centered around natural language
dialogue, such as AutoTutor, Why/Atlas, CIRCSUM Tutor, and others. Second, there are
some recent tutoring systems with speech recognition that were developed at Stanford
(Stanley Peters), University of Pittsburgh (Diane Litman), and Carnegie Mellon.

3. There is more systematic knowledge of dialog and discourse than the authors are aware
of. I recommend the read the journal Discourse Processes or the 2003 edited volume
Handbook of Discourse Processes.

4. The manuscript could be more focused rather than covering the entire field.